COLM TÓIBÍN’S BROOKLYN: CAUGHT BETWEEN HOME AND EXILE

Abstract: This paper is an analysis of the Irish novelist Colm Tóibín’s recent novel Brooklyn (2009) in which the author explores a string of intricate relationships between people and place while depicting the story of Irish emigration in 1950s. Tóibín employs simple expressive sentences in order to mirror his characters’ struggles in understanding the distance between the inner and the outer selves. As he grippingly portrays the strangeness of a new place, the central character in Brooklyn is dislocated in time and space creating a sense of melancholy and depression. The heroine’s loneliness in an unfamiliar city is pictured so vividly that she represents the immigrant experience caught between two worlds.

Key words: Colm Tóibín, Brooklyn, home, exile, place.

Introduction

Born in Enniscorthy, Co. Wexford in Ireland in 1955, Colm Tóibín has been an acclaimed writer of novels, travelogues, essays and newspaper columns. He is the author of six novels with which he has achieved wide international readership: The South, (1990) winner of The Irish Times Literature Prize in 1991; The Heather Blazing (1992), winner of the Encore Award for the best second novel in 1992; The Story of the Night (1997); The Blackwater Lightship (1999), shortlisted for the Man Booker Prize; The Master (2004) shortlisted for the Man Booker Prize and winner of the Los Angeles Times Novel of the Year and the Prix du Meilleur Livre Etranger in France and Brooklyn (2009), winner of the prestigious British literary prize Costa Novel of the Year Award in 2009. His novels do not only characterize Irish settings, but also places like Spain and Argentina where Tóibín has been drawn on his travels.

It is fashionable to characterize Irish literature as ‘sad’ and ‘miserable’. As a major and distinctive Irish writer, Tóibín, too, is a master of depicting melancholy, grief, and loneliness. However, his novels justify a more careful response than mere despair. He discovers very vividly the difficulty of the exile and the innerself of the lonely travelers as they try to make sense of their new existences in unfamiliar places. In order to discuss his main concerns which are the depiction of Irish society and living abroad, Tóibín undertakes the role of the unbiased observer. He believes that “any writer is an outsider...watching and plotting rather than participating.” (Bauch, 2009). While Tóibín reflects a breathtaking air of melancholy and grim sadness in his entire literary creation, he is careful not to dwell on any sense of victory. He confirms his mode of writing fiction in an interview by declaring that “Fiction lends itself to the powerless” and he articulates that “Fiction doesn’t really deal with triumph.” (Meyer, 2010). The process of his creativity depends on an understanding of detachment which has become a governing principle in his achieving a body of impeccable writing.
In *Brooklyn*, Tóibín portrays a series of opportunities and consequences of emigration and gives an account of a long history in order to depict Irish plight through the experiences of a powerless female character and traces her development from innocence to experience. Irish people have left their hometowns and emigrated to the United States or to England to find work and better living. In consequence the Irish have become a sub-class in England before the arrival of the Indians. Confronting racial integration, they have also been ranked as a sub-class with Jewish, Italian, Polish and coloured people in the hierarchical class structure of America.

While reflecting facts and presenting traumas in relation with Irish emigration, Tóibín is careful enough not to write a documentary. On the contrary he dramatizes his heroine’s experiences as border crossing becomes an identity crossing. Ruth Scurr labels the novel as Tóibín’s “most beautifully executed novel to date.” (2009). The story begins and ends in Tóibín’s hometown Enniscorthy, a small Irish town in the early 1950s where job opportunities are scarce for young people. And the novel focuses on Eilis’s sad life, a young woman, who lives with her widowed mother and elder sister Rose. As well as Enniscorthy, the story takes place in Brooklyn which becomes an epitome of a better new world, full of opportunities for immigrants.

2. Analysis

Eilis, a Celtic name which means God’s oath, is identified as “One of the most unforgettable characters in contemporary literature.” (Dilworth, 2009). The initial image of Eilis is of a passive recipient. She is depicted as hard-working, reserved, even uninteresting and she is more of an observer than an active participant in life. The opening lines of the novel, which portray her as sitting at the window and noticing her sister walking briskly from work, is reminiscent of James Joyce’s Eve-

about her qualifications, he assures her of better paid jobs in America whereas in England she might only get factory work as stated by her brothers. Father Flood promises to find her work and lodgings in Brooklyn whose parts are “just like Ireland, full of Irish.” (Tóibín, p. 23). Brooklyn is described as a land of great opportunity especially for young people. And Father Flood’s parish is a safe place filled with lovely people. Eilis is surprised by her mother’s and Rose’s approval of Father Flood’s arrangements for Eilis. She has never thought of going to America. She knows that many people go to England and they come back at Christmas or in the summer which has become “the part of the life of the town.” (Tóibín, p. 24). However, she also knows that people who had immigrated to America long before the war never come back home on holidays because of the long journey across the Atlantic. But on the other hand she has heard that the people who have gone to work in England do “ordinary work for ordinary money” (Tóibín, p. 24), while the people who have gone to work in America can become rich. Similarly, she has come to believe that “while people from the town who lived in England missed Enniscorthy, no one who went to America missed home. Instead, they were happy there and proud. She wondered if that could be true.” (Tóibín, p. 24). After returning to Brooklyn, Father Flood writes a letter to Eilis’s mother, telling her about the job he has found for Eilis. The vacant position is for the time being at a shop owned by an Italian merchant. However, if Eilis proves satisfactory in her first job, there will be plenty of “opportunity for promotion and very good prospects.” (Tóibín, p. 25). He also arranges documentation for the Embassy and finds suitable accommodation for Eilis near the church. Although she is caught in a dilemma, in her mind it is clear that she is nearer the decision to go to Brooklyn.

Eilis has never thought of a life outside Enniscorthy where she knows everyone, has the same friends and neighbours, the same routines in the same streets: “She had expected that she would find a job in the town, and then marry someone and give up the job and have children.” (Tóibín, p. 28). Although she is content with the conventional Irish life, unexpectedly she feels almost obliged to embark on a journey she is not willing. She wishes all the arrangements were for someone else. It is not easy for Eilis to leave the familiar: “She could wake in this bed every morning and move as the day went on in these familiar streets and come home to the kitchen, to her mother and Rose.” (Tóibín, p. 29). She is almost sure that she will miss the ordinary and she hates the idea that the rest of her life of her life will be “a struggle with the unfamiliar.” (Tóibín, p. 30). Eilis is passive and dutiful. She cannot say “Yes” or “No”. However, she realizes that Rose is in fact sacrificing her life by staying with her mother, which means that she will have to take care of her mother and cannot get married or leave the house as long as her mother lives.

On the day of departure Rose accompanies her sorrowful sister in Dublin until she takes the boat to Liverpool where she is to be met by her brother Jack before she sets out on her long journey to New York and then to Brooklyn. For her, America is “utterly foreign in its systems and its manners, yet it had an almost compensating glamour attached to it.” (Tóibín, p. 32). She begins to come to terms with the idea that working in America cannot even be compared to working in a shop in Birmingham, Liverpool, Coventry or even London. Even Irish sayings glorify America as uttered by Jack in order to console Eilis: “Time and patience would bring a snail to America.” (Tóibín, p. 33). Almost for all the Irish, America is the destination, a land of opportunities, and a myth of superiority.

Jack’s descriptions of his life in Birmingham indicate a sense of the Irish national psyche. The Irish live in ghettos in
England: They have their own pubs, and they are not integrated in the English society. However, her brother enjoys his freedom and his job at the car repairs. He describes English people as fair and decent and that they appreciate hard-work. When Irish people get shouted at on the streets of Birmingham, they learn to pay no attention. As Eilis learns about his brother’s new life in England, she is more optimistic for her life in America.

On the way to America, Eilis and the other travelers suffer hunger, nausea and claustrophobia in a week’s long journey on the ship. After a traumatic voyage she arrives at Mrs. Kehoe’s boarding house in Brooklyn where she will live with five other Irish lodgers. Initially, the weather in Brooklyn bothers her, it is “muggy and humid and everyone would move slowly and wearily in the streets.” (Tóibín, p. 53). Mrs. Kehoe who lives according to the rule of catholic correctness is a strict landlady and “before each evening they stood up solemnly and joined their hands and Mrs. Kehoe led them in saying grace.” (Tóibín, p. 54). She observes that Brooklyn is a strange place with many derelict buildings. She starts to work on the shop floor as she has done in Enniscorthy. Eilis’s descriptions are an account of Brooklyn with its ethnic neighborhoods which have occurred in the years following World War II. Miss Bartocci, the shop-owner, explains Eilis her duty and how she should treat the customers: “Brooklyn changes everyday...New people arrive and they could be Jewish or Irish or Polish or even coloured...We treat everyone the same. We welcome every single person who comes into this store. They all have money to spend. We keep our prices low and our manners high.” (Tóibín, p. 59). In that sense, Eilis broadens her view of a multicultural life together with improving her professional life. Her employer encourages the staff to do night classes for which she pays part of the tuition fee. Eilis explains every detail in her letters in which she rediscovers herself and her new surroundings. Thus her story reflects the lives of many other people exiled from home. In return, Rose writes to her “how quiet and dull the town was and how lucky Eilis was in the bright lights.” (Tóibín, p. 66). Eilis tries not to brood over her life in Enniscorthy – “the life she had lost and would never have again.” (Tóibín, p. 66). But is she really in the bright lights as Rose has written in her letter? On the contrary she thinks that “She was nobody here. It was not just that she had no friends and family; it was rather that she was a ghost in this room, in the streets on the way to work, on the shop floor. Nothing meant anything...Nothing here was part of her. It was false, empty.” (Tóibín, p. 67). She feels locked away, believing that she does not want to spend time in her “tomb of a bedroom.” (Tóibín, p. 70). A strong feeling of hatred dominates her inner self: “She hated this house...Its smells, its noises, its colours. She felt like she had been shut away and was trapped in a place where there was nothing. It was like hell.” (Tóibín, p. 70). Father Flood enrolls Eilis into a night class in bookkeeping and accountancy at Brooklyn College in order to help her with homesickness. In the bookkeeping course there are Italians and Jews with dark-skins and brown eyes who are diligent and serious-looking young men.

Eilis gets to know more Irish people in the course of time. She learns that many Irish people who arrived in America fifty years ago are all leftover Irishmen whom Father Flood sees once a year at Christmas. The Irish build the tunnels, bridges and highways in Brooklyn. Father Flood asks Eilis to help him arrange a Christmas gathering for these Irish people. When serving Irishmen their “Brooklyn-style” Christmas dinner, Eilis notices that some of them are “so poor-looking and so old, but even the younger ones had bad teeth and appeared worn down.” (Tóibín, p. 88). Those men remind her of her father and brothers in the
way they speak or smile, “the toughness in their faces softened by shyness, what had appeared stubborn or hard now strangely tender.” (Tóibín, p. 88). Few incidents in the novel underline Eilis’s encountering discrimination in various forms - against Italians, blacks, Jews, and lower-class Irish.

Amidst all the vivacity and mobility, Eilis feels a deep sense of depression and homesickness. Fortunately she overcomes the feeling of depression soon and finds friendship and love in her new life. However, she is inexperienced in relationships and does not know how to control her boyfriend. Thus the intimate and the intricate emotional and physical relationship lead to a severe blind alley. Ruth Scurr sees Eilis’s dilemma as “the result of inherited social expectation, combined with bad luck and failure of nerve.” (2009). While Father Flood, Rose and her mother have plotted a happy life for Eilis, contrarily she is trapped in a foreign environment finding comfort only in closing her eyes and trying to imagine nothing at all. Tóibín tolerantly builds up Eilis’s homesickness and nostalgia while portraying her relations with her lodger friends, her night classes and her pleasure in finding affordable women’s fashionable clothes. She realizes that in America there are hierarchies and for the most part there are Jewish, Italian and Irish immigrants.

Eilis is modest, but she’s also capable and resourceful. She is quick to understand Miss Bartocci’s requests about treating the coloured customers politely and with great care. Eilis observes how elegant the coloured customers are. There are detailed representations related to particular consumerist objects such as the nylon stockings which coloured customers are keen on to buy, in order to recreate the historical and cultural aspects of 1950s USA. At the same time Bartocci’s shop functions as a place to mirror the social change in class structures and race relations. Clare Bracken observes an insistence on material which functions as dominant conceptualizations of the material as passive object. Bracken identifies a danger within such a conceptualization which is highlighted in Father Flood’s proposal that they “need Irish girls in Brooklyn” (Tóibín, p. 81), which positions Eilis “as an object of exchange between cultures.” (Bracken, 2010, pp. 166-167).

Eilis’s night classes at Brooklyn College have become her salvation in overcoming her despondency. She passes the course easily and becomes a qualified bookkeeper. More importantly, she meets Tony, an Italian young man, at a dance organized by Father Flood at the parish hall. They start meeting regularly on Fridays; first they go to a diner, and then to the dance. Tony is “bright and funny” (Tóibín, p. 135). Eilis likes dancing with Tony especially when they move close to each other in the slow dances; she also likes walking home with him. She writes to Rose about Tony but tells her with reservation that he is a plumber. Eilis suggests that “in Brooklyn it was not always as easy to guess someone’s character by their job as it was in Enniscorthy.” (Tóibín, p. 140). Meeting Tony’s family and passing the exams have lifted her spirits: “she began to observe how beautiful everything was: the trees in leaf, the people in the street, the children playing, the light on the buildings. She had never felt like this in Brooklyn.” (Tóibín, p. 155). She is overcome with admiration: as Tony tells her about their future plans Eilis has realized how practical, serious and sincere he is.

However, Eilis is soon to be devastated by the dreadful news she has received from home. She is perished at learning that Rose has died in her sleep. Eilis decides to go back home on reading her brother’s letter about how lonely their mother is, and that they have to go back to Birmingham to work. She shows the letter to Tony and he understands that “she belonged to somewhere else, a place that he
Colm Tóibín’s Brooklyn: Caught between Home and Exile

could never know.” (Tóibín, p. 184). The letter has made him see “where her duty lay”, “that he was crying now for everything, for Rose who was dead, for her mother who was lonely, for Eilis who would have to go, and for himself who would be left.” (Tóibín, p. 184). Eilis arranges to go back to Enniscorthy for a month, which makes Tony insist that they get married before she leaves so that it is “something private between the two of us.” (Tóibín, p. 196). In fact it is unusual for an Irish girl to have a relationship with an Italian man. Nevermore she agrees to marry Tony - a decision which once more shows that she does not have a strong sense of herself, but she has a strong sense of what others make of her.

Eilis comes back home in Enniscorthy only to realize “how little it meant to her.” “She had longed so much for the familiarity of these rooms that she had presumed she would be happy and relieved to step back into them, but, instead, on this first morning, all she could do was count the days before she went back” to Brooklyn (Tóibín, p. 204). However, she has had to postpone her return ticket to America in order to attend her friend Nancy’s wedding. She goes out on several outings with her friends and comes closer with Jim Farrell, a rich man who has ignored her previously at the dance before Eilis goes to Brooklyn. As she sees her old friends and enjoys their company, she wishes that she did not marry Tony “not because she did not love him and intend to return to him, but because not telling her mother or her friends made everyday she had spent in America a sort of fantasy, something she could not match with the time she was spending at home.” (Tóibín, p. 218). At this point she feels a split personality in herself one of whom has struggled with hardship in Brooklyn and fallen in love there, and the other who is her mother’s dutiful daughter. But on the other hand she is aware that being at home is a great chance which she may not have again ever. Rose’s boss, who has refused Eilis before she goes to Brooklyn, asks her to work as a bookkeeper for him. She is puzzled at all those proposals to which Nancy responds by emphasizing that she has changed a lot after Brooklyn: “You seem more grown up and serious. And in your American clothes you look different.” (Tóibín, p. 230). As a matter of fact, she enjoys being more self-confident and taking Rose’s role with a strong idea of duty. She receives letters from Tony which make her think that everything about him seems distant. She realizes that everything else that has happened in Brooklyn appears “almost dissolved” and is not “richly present for her” anymore – her room in Mrs. Kehoe’s, her exams, the trolley-car from Brooklyn College back home, the dancehall, the apartment where Tony lives with his parents and his three brothers, or the shop floor at Bartocci’s are but a fantasy. She appreciates how much she has missed the familiarity and the idea of going back to Brooklyn frightens her. Proximity of Enniscorthy and distance of Brooklyn grow increasingly and the boiling heat of Brooklyn, Bartocci’s boring shop floor, her room at Mrs. Kehoe’s and even Tony are almost nothing but a distant memory. From a distance in time and place Brooklyn appears to be a life of tribulation full of “strange people, strange accents, strange streets.” (Tóibín, p. 232). Jim in Enniscorthy on the other hand is “a great catch, a young man in the town with his own business.” She imagines Tony and Jim and decides that Jim is “less eager than Tony, less funny, less curious, but more self-contained and more sure of his own place in the world.” (Tóibín, p. 236). Gradually Tony becomes “merely a shadow at the edge of every moment of the day and night.” (Tóibín, p. 237). Jim asks Eilis to get engaged, he confesses that he has always admired and loved her. Eilis has thought of telling Jim that she is married and asking his help in order to tell her what to do.
However, she changes her mind, because Jim is conservative. He likes his position in the town, and it is important to him that he runs a respectable pub and comes from a respectable family. This is the turning point when Eilis decides that there is only one way out for her which is to go back to Brooklyn to Tony because she knows that divorce is a big step in those times in Ireland. She is indeed actively deceiving others by not saying anything to others. She feels strongly that she has to go back and confirms her return ticket before telling her mother that she is married to Tony. She wishes her mother were angry with her. As she leaves Enniscorthy early in the morning, she stops at Jim Farrell’s and drops a note for him, saying that she has to go back to Brooklyn.

3. Findings

The choice in the end is painful and difficult. No matter however hard Eilis tries to distinguish between the real and the fantasy, she chooses to go back to an unfamiliar world because of her desperation in a narrow-minded environment where divorce is almost impossible. Much of the novel is devoted to portray the power of the immediate place in which one lives. Indeed, Eilis is involved greatly in the instant environment either in Enniscorthy or Brooklyn, making the closer place real and the further one a mere fantasy. Similarly, Liesl Schillinger of the New York Times highlights that in Brooklyn, Colm Tóibín “quietly, modestly shows how place can assert itself, enfolding the visitor, staking its claim.” (Schillinger, 2009).

Tóibín pictures Eilis’s duality and her deep attachment to Tony straightforwardly. The novel discreetly offers both an account of “an immigrant coming to terms with life in her new land and an equally appealing story of one young woman’s grasp of a hard-won maturity.” (Freedenberg). In other words, it is a story that traces a change in a woman’s development from inexperience to experience as she moves between an Irish small-town and an alluring multi-cultural Brooklyn.

As a central character, Eilis is rather a conventional and unremarkable heroine and Tóibín explores her struggles in a quite conventional structure without experimenting with different forms. In an interview the author emphasizes that his main issue is not the tone which is rather traditional, but he is more interested in the levels of secrecy and silence that go beneath words. In that sense, he argues that a sentence which might seem quite simple actually is concealing a lot. (Galvin, 2009). Similarly Tóibín has declared that he has benefitted from the power of secrets and that he has the ultimate control of point of view. He is careful to imagine “a psychology rather than a topography, a character rather than a time and place.” (Toibin, 2009). Indeed, behind many simple sentences, Christopher Tayler emphasizes a powerful sense of humour in the novel’s grim feel which the author deliberately represses (Tayler, 2009), especially the scenes where Eilis entertains her mother and Rose while explaining them what has happened at Miss Keohe’s shop. In terms of under-scoring the power of secrets Tóibín is very skilful in dramatizing the secrecy of domestic relations in Ireland: “what happens within the family remains so secretive, so painfully locked within each person that any writer who deals with the dynamics of family life stands apart.” (Wiesenfarth, 2009. pp. 1–27). He deals relentlessly with lack of communication between the family members. In one scene when Eilis finally decides to go back to Brooklyn, her mother does not tell her that she will be missed. Again in the beginning of the novel, Eilis is not able to tell her mother and Rose that she does not want to leave Enniscorthy. In this context, Tóibín noticeably reflects the Irish women’s reservation in being frank to each other: “They could do everything except say out loud what it was they were thinking.” (Holton, 2009). Similarly, Rose
never reveals the fact that she is ill and Ellis never discloses her secret marriage.

Overall Eilis’s life is representative of the experiences of the Irish immigrants in the United States. The novel deals with the unchanging Irish identity in a foreign land emphasizing a sense of great homesickness even though they try hard to become American. Once back in Enniscorthy, Eilis has become the centre of attraction with her new self. And before she faces a choice between the old life and the new, it is clear that America has made her glamorous and desirable. Tóibín is fascinated with the character of the “powerless woman” who is also very present in Jane Austen, George Eliot ad Henry James’s novels. It is imperative for him that he capture the powerless heroine’s sensitivity as “she watches the world with a mixture of unease and noticing everything” (Arana, 2009) an aptitude that a man is not in possession of. Similarly Robert Hanks emphasizes a sense of clarity, simplicity and elegance in Tóibín’s writing. Indeed Eilis’s ordinary life is so poignantly presented and her homesickness is so realistically illustrated in a mode of “American openness and Irish respectability.” (Hanks, 2009). The control of the third person narration draws an objective picture of a small-town attitude whose powerful traditional values restrain the denizens. Thus Eilis faces continuous apprehension between her inner thoughts and outer actions in an environment of incessant conformity which is determined by strict traditions. Tóibín keeps a sense of ambiguity very tactfully in Eilis’s tragedy of choice until the end of the novel whereby contrary to expectations, Eilis decides to go back to Brooklyn because she realizes that she has nothing left to go back to in Enniscorthy and she knows that “nothing she could do would be right.”

4. Conclusion

Brooklyn is a sad story of Irish emigration in an impression of post-war Irish singularity. Tóibín reproduces, through memories, Eilis’s self-remark, her conflict between personal freedom and responsibility, together with the emotional content of a young woman’s life in a Proustian narrative. He carefully gives minute details in order to describe Eilis’s life which is mainly determined by homesickness and loss. While exile is almost expected of the obedient daughter, Eilis’s family inadvertently has caused sadness and bitterness in her life. Tóibín skillfully avoids sentimentalizing Eilis’s understanding of either Ireland or America. Her quest for home starts at the moment when she accepts to leave quietly which also creates an occasion for the author to illustrate Irish people’s glowing view of America.

Ireland possesses a distinguished body of literature about home and exile, and Brooklyn is, beyond doubt, more than a remarkable contribution. The writer excludes any sense of sentimentality from the mainstream immigrant novel and emphasizes a feeling of immense emotional force as he redefines the immigrant novel to signify that “to emigrate is to become a foreigner in two places at once.” (Bookreview, 2009). Thus Tóibín ends Brooklyn before Eilis embarks the ship back to America, leaving her as dispossessed of both lands in a state of being caught between home and exile.

References
2. Bauch, Chelsea (2009), Colm Tóibín Turns the Page on Brooklyn, Exclusive, 20 May.
10. Scurr, Ruth (2009), „Colm Tóibín’s beautiful Brooklyn“, The Times Literary Supplement, 29 April.
15. Wiesenfarth, Joseph (2009), „An Interview with Colm Tóibín“, Contemporary Literature, 50 (1), pp. 1–27.

**BROOKLYN КОЛМА ТОЈБИНА: ИЗМЕЂУ ДОМОВИНЕ И ЕГЗИЛА**

Резиме

Рад представља анализу новијег романа Колма Тојбина (Colm Tóibín) Brooklyn (2009), у којем аутор истражује низ веза између људи и мјеста приликом представљања приче о писацкој имиграцији педесетих година ХХ вијека. Тојбин ко- ристи јед nostave експресивне реченице да представи настојање ликова да схвате дистанце између унутрашњег и спољашњег бића. Док представља отуђеност неговог мјеста, главни лик овог романа дислоциран је у простору и времену и код њега се јавља меланхолија и депресија. Јунакњина усамљеност у непознатом граду представљена је тако живо- писно да одражава имигрантско искуство ухваћено између два свијета.

dilekinan@hotmail.com